

**HAYES TOWNSHIP
PLANNING COMMISSION
Charlevoix Country Club – Blake Holdings
September 20, 2016**

On September 20, 2016, at 6:00 p.m. the Hayes Township Planning Commission met at the Charlevoix Country Club event barn located at 11519 Stonebridge, Charlevoix for a site visit.

Planning Commission members present were Jim Rudolph, Marilyn Morehead, Pat Phillips, Cliff Biddick and Ed Bajos. Bob Jess and Steve Wilson were absent. Also presents were Marlene Golovich, Secretary and Larry Sullivan, Zoning Administrator. Members of the public present were Rik Lobenherz, Tom Niswonger, Fred Taylor, Anne Kantola, Kathy Weber, Jack Weber, Carol Ashley, Mike Ascione, John Kunitzer, Dan Barron, Alene Haley, David Levy, Dennis Phelps, Jeanne Phelps, Diane Priess, Joe Spohn, Pippa Spohn, Don Thurow and Susan Thurow.

Larry Sullivan stated that the reason for the site visit was to familiarize the Planning Commission with the site, the event barn and available parking. He also stated that immediately following the site visit the meeting would move to the Hayes Township Hall, 09195 Old US 31 N, Charlevoix for the public hearing.

The Country Club made a slide presentation and explained the evolution of the site. The barn has 9000 sq. ft of usable space and has been used for events for the last two years. This year they booked 24 events. They are proposing the addition of restrooms which would be hooked up to an existing sewer system. Typically events are held from noon to midnight.

Chair Marilyn Morehead called this public hearing of the Planning Commission to order at 6:37 p.m. at the Hayes Township Hall, 09195 Old US 31, Charlevoix

Planning Commission members Bob Jess and Steve Wilson joined the meeting at this point.

The Planning Commission members reviewed the minutes from the August 16, 2016 regular meeting. Cliff Biddick made a motion, supported by Pat Phillips to accept the minutes as corrected. Motion carried.

Jim Rudolph reported on Township Board activities. The Township Board hired Becket and Raeder as the new planner and approved his proposal contingent on Planning Commission approval. The Board adopted an amendment to the Park Ordinance. They also gave approval to apply for two more grants for the boat launch. The Board is seeking a bid from Tim Berry to repair the roof on the host house at Camp Sea-Gull. A veterans memorial dedication has been set for Saturday, November 5. A bid for a speaker system for the township hall was received and Buday Sound system will make a presentation at the October board meeting. Bob Jess asked if the roofing job at Camp Sea-Gull would be put out for bids. Jim Rudolph stated that they may use a roofer in the Township. Bob

stated that both he and Ed Bajos were builders that live in the township and they could do roofing too.

The purpose of the hearing is to take public comment on an application from Blake Holdings, LLC for a Planned Unit Development amendment to allow the conversion of the maintenance barn to an event center. The property involved is located at 11519 Stonebridge, Charlevoix, (Charlevoix Country Club) with property tax numbers 15-007-118-012-10.

Larry Sullivan stated the he believed there were two issues the PC should consider;

1. Special Use Permit
2. Site Plan Review

He stated the PC should consider if the proposed use of this barn was a normal use for a country club. He further stated that uses should not interfere with the surrounding area and the uses in the surrounding area and regular hours of operation should be established.

Public Comments

Jonathan Webber provided a letter (see attached)

David Levy stated he was glad they saved the building but the fireworks need to stop.

Dana Fields is concerned about the noise from fireworks and music.

Don Thurow stated he does not hear the music but supports Webbers limitations.

Closed Public Comments

The Planning Commission discussed the proposed use and the consensus was the use as an event barn was appropriate at a County Club.

The Planning Commission reviewed the following:

- H. Standards for PUD Approval; Conditions; Waiver of PUD Standards.*
- 1) *General Standards.* The Planning Commission shall approve, or approve with conditions, a PUD application if the Planning Commission finds that the proposed PUD meets the standards of **Article V** and **Section 6.02.4** and all of the following:
 - a) The planned unit development shall be consistent with the Hayes Township Master Plan. **Yes**
 - b) The planned unit development shall be designed, constructed, operated and maintained in a manner harmonious with the character of adjacent property and the surrounding area. Landscaping shall ensure that proposed uses will be adequately buffered from one another and from surrounding public and private property and will be consistent with outdoor pedestrian movement. Vegetation proposed by the developer or required by the Planning Commission shall be maintained in a healthy living condition and such vegetation if dead shall be replaced. **Yes**

- c) The planned unit development shall not change the essential character of the surrounding area, unless such change is consistent with the Township's current master plan. **Does not change**
- d) The planned unit development shall be designed to preserve public vistas and existing important natural, historical, and architectural features of significance within the development. **The historical barn is being preserved.**
- e) The planned unit development shall be designed so that its pedestrian, non-motorized and automobile circulation systems are safely and conveniently integrated with those of abutting property and any linear trail or park systems intersecting or abutting such development. **True with parking modifications**
- f) The planned unit development shall provide that vehicular and pedestrian traffic within the site shall be safe and convenient and that parking layout will not adversely interfere with the flow of traffic within the site or to and from the adjacent streets. Safe and adequate access for emergency vehicles to or within the development and adequate space for turning around at street ends shall be provided. **Conditions will apply.**
- g) The planned unit development shall not result in any greater storm water runoff to adjacent property after development, than before. The open space shall be provided with ground cover suitable to control erosion, and vegetation which no longer provides erosion control shall be replaced. **Yes**
- h) The design of the planned unit development shall exhibit a reasonably harmonious relationship between the location of buildings on the site relative to buildings on lands in the surrounding area; and there shall be a reasonable architectural and functional compatibility between all structures on the site and structures within the surrounding area. It is not intended that contrasts in architectural design and use of facade materials is to be discouraged, but care shall be taken so that any such contrasts will not be so out of character with existing building designs and facade materials so as to create an adverse effect on the stability and value of the surrounding area. **Yes it fits.**

- i) The planned unit development shall be designed such that phases of development are in a logical sequence, so that any one phase will not depend upon a subsequent phase for adequate access, public utility services, and drainage or erosion control. **They will have public sewer and water.**
- j) The planned unit development shall provide for underground installation of all utilities. **Yes, they will have underground utilities.**

The Planning Commission reviewed the following:

5. Standards for Granting Site Plan Approval:

- A. The Planning Commission shall approve, or approve with conditions, an application for a site plan only upon a finding that the proposed site plan complies with all applicable provisions of this Ordinance and the standards listed below, unless the Planning Commission waives a particular standard upon a finding that the standard is not applicable to the proposed development under consideration and the waiver of that standard will not be significantly detrimental to surrounding property. The Planning Commission's decision shall be in writing and shall include findings of fact, based on evidence presented on each standard. These standards are listed in subsections 1-11 listed below.
 - 1) All elements of the site plan shall be designed so that there is a limited amount of change in the overall natural contours of the site and shall minimize reshaping in favor of designing the project to respect existing features of the site in relation to topography, the size and type of the lot, the character of adjoining property and the type and size of buildings. The site shall be so developed as not to impede the normal and orderly development of surrounding property for uses permitted in this Ordinance. **It looks nice and meets this standard**
 - 2) The landscape shall be preserved in its natural state, insofar as practical, by minimizing tree and soil removal, and by topographic modifications which result in smooth natural appearing slopes as opposed to abrupt changes in grade between the project and adjacent areas. **Building already exists.**
 - 3) Special attention shall be given to proper site drainage so that removal of storm waters will not adversely affect neighboring properties. **There are ditches on the sides of the road and it drains to the natural area to the west. The ponds are used to water the golf course.**

- 4) The site plan shall provide reasonable, visual and sound privacy for all dwelling units located therein. Fences, walls, barriers and landscaping shall be used, as appropriate, for the protection and enhancement of property and for the privacy of its occupants. **No amplification on weekdays after 10:00 p.m., Sunday through Thursday, except on holiday weekends where Monday is a holiday. Friday and Saturday no amplification after 11:30 p.m. this includes Sundays if Monday is a holiday. Music must always be inside.**
- 5) All buildings or groups of buildings shall be so arranged as to permit emergency access by some practical means to all sides. **Yes it is available.**
- 6) Every structure or dwelling unit shall have access to a public street, private road, walkway or other area dedicated to common use. **It does meet this standard.**
- 7) All loading and unloading areas and outside storage areas, including areas for the storage of trash, which face or are visible from residential districts or public thoroughfares, shall be screened, by a vertical screen consisting of structural or plant materials no less than six feet in height. **On the southwest side it is buffered by the barn and cedar trees.**
- 8) Exterior lighting shall be arranged as follows:
 - a) It is deflected away from adjacent properties.
 - b) It does not impede the vision of traffic along adjacent streets.
 - c) It does not unnecessarily illuminate night skies.**There are two lights on timers and they may put low solar units in the parking area.**
- 9) The arrangement of public or common ways for vehicular and pedestrian circulation shall respect the pattern of existing or planned streets and pedestrian or bicycle pathways in the area. Streets and drives which are part of an existing or planned street pattern which serves adjacent development shall be of a width appropriate to the traffic volume they will carry and shall have a dedicated right-of-way. **Parking is not allowed on the sides of the road.**
- 10) All streets shall be developed in accordance with any adopted Township private road standards, or if a public road, the County Road Commission specifications. **No new roads are being developed.**
- 11) Site plans shall conform to all applicable requirements of state and

federal statutes and the Hayes Township Master Plan, and approval may be conditioned on the applicant receiving necessary state and federal permits before the actual zoning permit authorizing the special land use is granted. **Alcohol permits are in place.**
Building permits will be obtained before adding rest rooms.

Cliff Biddick made a motion, supported by Bob Jess to approve the Planned Unit Development amendment and site plan to allow the conversion of the maintenance barn to an event center based on the findings of Article V., Section 5.03, with the following reasonable conditions.

10. Conditional Approvals. The Planning Commission may impose reasonable conditions with the approval of a site plan, pursuant to *Section 9.03* of this Ordinance.

The applicant will provide adequate parking. Currently they have parking for 400 guests, 48 parking spots at the barn and 75 parking sites in the designated overflow area. They have attendants that handle parking. They will provide landscape buffering of the parking areas and the areas around the barn and parking areas must be cleaned up by 8:00 a.m. No parking will be allowed on the sides of the road. The Zoning Administrator must have a to-scale as built site plan showing all parking areas.

No sound amplification will be allowed after 10:00 p.m. Sunday through Thursday unless Monday is a holiday. No sound amplification will be allowed after 11:30 p.m. Friday and Saturday; this includes Sundays if Monday is a holiday. All music must be inside.

Fireworks and Chinese Lanterns are prohibited.

Yays: Steve Wilson, Cliff Biddick, Bob Jess, Jim Rudolph, Marilyn Morehead, Ed Bajos, Pat Phillips
Nays
Motion carried.

New Business

The Township Board of Trustees approved hiring Beckett and Raeder as the new planner pending Planning Commission approval. Marilyn stated she likes his proposal but wants to change the meetings with a PC Committee to meetings with the entire Planning Commission. The planner wants to conduct an online survey regarding changes to the waterfront regulations. The PC will send a post card alerting everyone to the survey and will provide hard copies to anyone requesting one.

Pat Phillips asked how many people view our web page, is there a counter.

Cliff Biddick made a motion, supported by Jim Rudolph to approve the proposal by Beckett and Raeder. Motion carried.

Zoning Administrator, Larry Sullivan presented a written report with an oral overview.

Ed Bajos made a motion, supported by Pat Phillips to change the date of the next Planning Commission to Monday October 17, 2016. Motion carried.

The next meeting of the Planning Commission is October 17, 2016.

Bob Jess stated that he attended a County Planning Commission meeting and the recording secretary does not speak during the meeting. He thinks it is inappropriate for the recording secretary to speak at meetings. Pat Phillips stated that Marlene knows a great deal about zoning and appreciates her comments. Bob stated that he is glad comments go through the chair and wanted to know why the chair sent an email to Marlene before sending it to the PC. Marilyn explained that the email was sent to the Clerk so it could be included in the BOT packets. Marilyn also stated she has witnessed Bob's personal attacks on Marlene and that he should make a complaint to the Board if he is unhappy how she chairs the PC. Jim Rudolph stated that at one time the Township hired an outsider to be the PC secretary to replace a PC member. It was done because it was too hard to take minutes and participate in the discussions. Currently we have a knowledgeable person as secretary and finds Marlene's comments helpful. Bob stated again that he finds it inappropriate.

Cliff Biddick made a motion, supported by Jim Rudolph to adjourn the meeting at 8:30 p.m. Motion carried.

Respectively Submitted

Marlene Golovich, recording secretary

Pat Phillips Planning Commission Secretary

Minutes approved as written November 15, 2016